



Teaching about
Columbus in
1992 and Beyond

A Resource
Packet for
Teachers

Colorado Indian
Education
Association

Denver
American Indian
Education
Advisory Council

September, 1992

Teaching about Columbus
in 1992 and Beyond
A Resource Packet for Teachers

Colorado Indian Education Association

Denver American Indian Education Advisory Council

September, 1992

Acknowledgements

Special acknowledgement and thanks must go to the following organizations for their support of and commitment to this project:

- Colorado Indian Affairs Commission
- Denver Public Schools
- Mid-Continent Regional Educational Laboratory
- School of Education of the University of Colorado at Denver
- University College of the University of Denver

Produced by:

The Colorado Indian Education Association
and
The American Indian Education Advisory Council
of the Denver Public Schools
975 Grant Street
Denver, Colorado 80203
(303) 764-3579

September, 1992

Cover illustration by Karen Recktenwald

Table of Contents

Section	Page
Acknowledgements	ii
Colorado Indian Education Association Denver American Indian Education Advisory Council: Recommendations for Teaching about the Columbian Quincentenary in 1992 and Beyond	1
YEAR OF THE AMERICAN INDIAN	3
STATEMENT REGARDING OBSERVANCE OF THE COLUMBUS QUINCENTENNIAL ANNIVERSARY BY THE NATIONAL INDIAN EDUCATION ASSOCIATION	4
NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR THE SOCIAL STUDIES POSITION STATEMENT COLUMBIAN QUINCENTENARY – 1992	7
Practical Guidelines for Teaching about Columbus	10
Choosing Instructional Materials for Teaching about Columbus	12
Teaching Plans for 1992 and Beyond	13
Teaching about Columbus in the Primary Grades	14
The Environment	15
The Meeting	18
It's Mine!	21
Teaching about Columbus in the Intermediate Grades Preserving History	23
Biological and Cultural Change	26
Teaching about Columbus in the Middle School How Historical Inaccuracies Impact the Present	30
Teaching about Columbus in High School Myths and Distortions of Fact	36
A Unit: Creating a Play about the Encounter between Columbus and Native Peoples of the Americas	42
Bibliography	47

Colorado Indian Education Association
Denver American Indian Education Advisory Council

Recommendations for Teaching
about the Columbian Quincentenary
in 1992 and Beyond

For the great community of the Americas, and for the rest of the world, the year 1492 holds deep historical and cultural consequence. From any point of view it must be recognized that the Spanish ships — La Nina, La Pinta, and Santa Maria, captained by Christopher Columbus and others, were on the dawn of October 12 carrying the protagonists of an astonishing encounter of two worlds. From that moment, nothing would ever be the same. (Susan Sharp, *Columbus and the Americas 1492-1992*. Pomegranate Calendars)

This collision of two old worlds changed forever the lives of the indigenous peoples of the Americas, as well as the lives of the people of Africa and Europe. To study only the life of Christopher Columbus, his ships, and his historic landing is to trivialize and distort history. Traditionally, the study of Columbus and the European “discovery” of the Americas has been largely based on folklore, omissions, and inaccuracies. With increased scholarship and greater sensitivity to the impact on Native peoples, teachers are faced with a professional challenge to teach all students in new, more accurate, and critical ways.

The following recommendations, developed by the Colorado Indian Education Association and the Denver American Indian Education Advisory Council, are meant to guide and assist classroom teachers as they prepare to teach about this historic event.

These groups of Indian parents and educators recommend that all students throughout Colorado should:

1. learn about the rich and diverse societies that populated the Americas before 1492,
2. explore the biological and cultural consequences of the mutual encounter,
3. recognize the enduring impact of European value systems and world views on the political, environmental, and social issues of today,
4. understand that any historical event is experienced and interpreted from a variety of perspectives, and
5. respect the beauty, integrity, spirituality, and sovereignty of Indian cultures and tribal governments, in the past and in the present.

Further, we recommend that these learning activities should:

1. be historically and culturally accurate,
2. be developmentally appropriate,
3. be interdisciplinary,
4. use varied instructional materials and primary sources, whenever possible,
5. explore values and ethical issues, and
6. foster critical and creative thought.

Included in this packet are (1) a Congressional resolution proclaiming the *Year of the American Indian* and position statements of the National Indian Education Association and the National Council for the Social Studies, endorsed by more than 30 educational organizations, (2) guidelines for teaching about the Quincentenary and other Indian topics, (3) sample teaching plans and units, and (4) a bibliography of recommended books, instructional materials, and appropriate resources.

The encounter with the Europeans resulted in the devastation and subjection of the indigenous peoples. For Indian people, Columbus Day is not a day to be celebrated. Europeans brought nearly 500 years of destructive disease, warfare, subjugation, and the weakening of proud and independent tribes, families, and traditional lifeways. Students must recognize that the collision of two worlds had long-term biological and cultural consequences — many of which were not positive. Indian Nations should not be perceived as merely another ethnic minority group in the United States. We are the original inhabitants of this land, with rich and diverse cultures in existence at the time of the Columbian encounter. We have a special kinship to the land. We endure as separate nations and maintain a constitutionally recognized relationship with the United States government. We ask that the commemoration of the landing of Christopher Columbus in the Western Hemisphere be taught with historical accuracy and with sensitivity to the original inhabitants of this continent.

For once.... white America can make an effort to see this nation through the eyes of the Indian people, and maybe then they will understand why Indians will never be assimilated into a melting pot that would destroy them as a people.

Although their land base has greatly diminished and some cultures have been destroyed or altered, the one thing that has remained, even though it had to go underground for a few hundred years in order to survive, is the spirituality of the Indian people. This spirituality lives on, and having never died, need not be reborn. Perhaps this is the legacy of the indigenous people since Christopher Columbus. (Tim Giago, editor of *The Lakota Times* in Rapid City, South Dakota)

YEAR OF THE AMERICAN INDIAN

Congress passed the following joint resolution authorizing the President to proclaim 1992 as the "Year of the American Indian."

Whereas American Indians are the original inhabitants of the lands that now constitute the United States of America;

Whereas American Indian governments developed the fundamental principles of freedom of speech and the separation of powers in government, and these principles form the foundation of the United States Government today;

Whereas American Indian societies exhibited a respect for the finite quality of natural resources through deep respect for the earth, and such values continue to be widely held today;

Whereas American Indian people have served with valor in all wars that the United States has engaged in, from the Revolutionary War to the conflict in the Persian Gulf, often serving in greater numbers, proportionately, than the population of the Nation as a whole;

Whereas American Indians have made distinct and important contributions to the United States and the rest of the world in many fields, including agriculture, medicine, music, language, and art;

Whereas it is fitting that American Indians be recognized for their individual contributions as artists, sculptors, musicians, authors, poets, artisans, scientists, and scholars;

Whereas the five hundredth anniversary of the arrival of Christopher Columbus to the Western Hemisphere is an especially appropriate occasion for the people of the United States to reflect on the long history of the original inhabitants of this continent and appreciate that the "discoverees" should have as much recognition as the "discoverer";

Whereas the peoples of the world will be refocusing with special interest on the significant contributions that American Indians have made to society;

Whereas the Congress believes that such recognition of their contributions will promote self-esteem, pride, and self-awareness in American Indians young and old; and

Whereas 1992 represents the first time that Americans will have been recognized through the commemoration of a year in their honor;

Now, therefore, be it resolved by the Senate and House of Representatives of the United States of America in Congress assembled, that 1992 is designated as the "Year of the American Indian." The President is authorized and requested to issue a proclamation calling upon federal, state, and local governments, interested groups and organizations, and the people of the United States to observe the year with appropriate programs, ceremonies, and activities.

Native Monthly Reader, 3(5), p. 3.

STATEMENT REGARDING OBSERVANCE OF THE COLUMBUS QUINCENTENNIAL ANNIVERSARY BY THE NATIONAL INDIAN EDUCATION ASSOCIATION

July 16, 1992

The National Indian Education Association (NIEA) takes this opportunity to share the following perspectives about the Columbus Quincentennial Anniversary in 1992. These perspectives are offered in keeping with that part of the mission statement of NIEA which advocates "promoting educational research, educational advancement, and education personnel development."

The National Indian Education Association believes that the dominant European and Euro-American response to this anniversary year should entail a reflective and contemplative silence so that the indigenous voices can be fully heard. The NIEA believes that this year of 1992 should mark the beginning of an extended exploration of indigenous perspectives at all grade levels in all subject areas of American school systems. Such an exploration is required to counter the hundreds of years of Eurocentric conditioning that is responsible for institutionalizing monoculturalism in schools and communities everywhere.

Only by integrating indigenous perspectives into world history can there be a meaningful global understanding about the consequences of two global hemispheres coming together on October 12, 1492. The NIEA seeks this global understanding so that the basic human rights of indigenous peoples of the Western Hemisphere will be respected and their cultures fully recognized for the many contributions to the world.

The National Indian Education Association observes the Columbus Quincentennial by advocating a stronger understanding of the following perspectives:

- The Columbus expedition commissioned under Spanish national authority in 1492 was indeed one of the most significant events in human history. This event is best described as the meeting of two global hemispheres, not as a discovery of a new world. The Western Hemisphere of that time was already inhabited by indigenous populations having rich, diverse cultures and communities with origins at least 15,000 years old prior to 1492.
- Given the subsequent impact and influence of this historical event, the arrival of Columbus should be understood as the beginning of genocide, land and human resource exploitation, disease, slavery, colonialism, cultural repression, human suffering, and termination inflicted upon the indigenous populations of the Western Hemisphere. These forces caused tremendous destruction and loss of human life among many Native populations.
- It should be understood that the forces of the Columbus legacy continue today to perpetuate cultural repression, land resource exploitation, socioeconomic suppression, and the denial of basic human rights of the descendants still living among the Western Hemisphere's indigenous nations. In spite of efforts to broaden historical perspectives by conscientious citizenry, in

particular by the descendants of indigenous nations, the dominant world view continues to sustain the manifestations of the Columbus legacy by ignoring, obscuring, or distorting the indigenous world view of historical and current events.

- Because of the narrow focus of the dominant world view, the political injustices and socioeconomic conditions imposed upon indigenous populations of the Western Hemisphere, including American Indian and Alaska Native citizens of the United States, cannot be fully understood and appreciated among other nations. Until there is a fundamental change in the dominant world view about the Columbus legacy, the way we look at the histories of human events will never allow for the full realization and exercise of basic human rights among all nations of the world.

Therefore, in observance of the Columbus Quincentennial Anniversary in 1992, the National Indian Education Association calls for:

1. A global commitment by all world nations and educational institutions to listen to and institutionalize the perspectives of the indigenous people of the Western Hemisphere. This will help establish an accurate and balanced accounting of the historical events and influences commemorated by the Columbus Quincentenary.
2. Forums of world leaders, policy makers, and educators to create a stronger global understanding about the principles of sovereignty inherent within the government-to-government relationships among indigenous nations of the Western Hemisphere, especially for the American Indian and Alaska Native citizens of the United States.
3. Partnerships among private, public, and American Indian/Alaska Native educational institutions for the purpose of strengthening awareness about the presence of the indigenous people and their cultures in the Western Hemisphere. There should be a fundamental understanding that American Indian and Alaska Native people reside on federal reservations, rural communities, and urban settings of the United States.
4. Curricula that broaden contemporary perspectives about the many historical contributions of American Indians and Alaska Natives in such fields as agriculture, government, engineering, and medicine.
5. Alliances among American businesses and educational institutions that would diminish the negative impact of myths, stereotypes, misrepresentations, and cultural/ethnic ignorance that sustain prejudiced and biased public attitudes toward American Indian and Alaska Native people.
6. Revalidation of U.S. government-to-government commitments via Constitutional amendment, treaty, and/or federal legislation that will ensure the recognition and protection of basic human rights of American Indian and Alaska Native People. These would include but not be limited to the maintenance of self-governance, the conservation of tribal land bases and resources, the practice of

religious freedom, the retention of Native languages, the development and administration of tribally controlled education, and the general pursuit of self-determination goals that will benefit American Indian and Alaska Native citizens living in reservation, rural community, and urban environments.

7. Discontinuation of the term "minority" in reference to American Indian and Alaska Native people so that the unique political status of these citizens will be recognized and that these Native people will be identified as they choose to be identified.
8. Commitments among American educational institutions and businesses to ensure that higher education resources, affirmative action strategies, including Indian preference, and equal employment opportunities, can be validated to benefit American Indians and Alaska Natives when such resources and opportunities are made available specifically for these people.
9. Assembly of a federally mandated National Indian Education convention every fourth year from 1992 to convene American Indian and Alaska Native representatives to assess the ongoing progress of tribal land and human resource development in the United States; to develop strategies for strengthening the education of all American citizens; and to offer recommendations to the U.S. Congress for the preservation and nurturing of American Indian and Alaska Native governmental relationships within the international community.
10. Creation of an education coalition or network among all indigenous nations of the Western Hemisphere for the purpose of sharing mutual goals, research, and strategies for the development of relevant, culturally appropriate educational programs that would ensure basic human rights and respect for the multicultural relationships among all global nations.

**NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR THE SOCIAL STUDIES
POSITION STATEMENT
COLUMBIAN QUINCENTENARY – 1992
OCTOBER, 1991**

Nineteen ninety-two is the 500th anniversary of Columbus' first voyage to the Americas. The voyage of Columbus is a much too significant event in human history for the nation's schools and colleges to ignore or to treat romantically or trivially. The most fitting and enduring way in which educators can participate in commemorating the quincentenary is to examine seriously the available scholarship to enhance our knowledge about 1492 and, in turn, to enhance the knowledge of our students. Specifically, educators should:

- * help students comprehend the contemporary relevance of 1492, and
- * provide students with basic, accurate knowledge about Columbus's voyages, their historical setting, and unfolding effects.

Sixty years after Columbus's first landfall in the Americas, Francisco Lopez de Gomara wrote: "The greatest event since the creation of the world (excluding the incarnation and death of Him who created it) is the discovery of the Indies." In the year the 13 English colonies declared their independence from Britain, Adam Smith observed: "The discovery of America, and that of a passage to the East Indies by the Cape of Good Hope, are the two greatest and most important events recorded in the history of mankind.

Although these two famous assessments of the significance of 1492 in human history may be overstatements, it is certainly true that the world as we know it would not have come to be were it not for the chain of events set in motion by European contact with the Americas.

The Contemporary Relevance of 1492

One of the most significant and visible features of the contemporary United States is its multiethnic and culturally pluralistic character. Scholars describe the United States as one of history's first universal or world nations – its people are a microcosm of humanity with biological, cultural, and social ties to all other parts of the earth. The origin of these critical features of our demographic and our civic life lies in the initial encounters and migrations of peoples and cultures of the Americas, Europe, and Africa.

Another significant features of the United States is the fact that the nation and its citizens are an integral part of a global society created by the forces that began to unfold in 1492.

Geographically, the Eastern and Western Hemispheres were joined after millennia of virtual isolation from one another.

Economically, the growth of the modern global economy was substantially stimulated by the bullion trade linking Latin America, Europe, and Asia; the slave trade connecting Africa, Europe, and the Americas; and the fur trade joining North America, Western Europe, and Russia.

Politically, the contemporary worldwide international system was born in the extension of intra-European conflict into the Western Hemisphere, the establishment of European colonies in the Americas, and the accompanying intrusion of Europeans into the political affairs of Native Americans, and the Native Americans' influence on the political and military affairs of European states.

Ecologically, the massive trans-continental exchange of plants, animals, micro-organisms, and natural resources initiated by the Spanish and Portuguese voyages modified the global ecological system forever.

Basic Knowledge About the Historical Setting and Effects of Columbus's Voyages

Educators should ensure that good contemporary scholarship and reliable traditional sources be used in teaching students about Columbus's voyages, their historical settings, and unfolding effects. Scholarship highlights some important facets of history that are in danger of being disregarded, obscured, or ignored in the public hyperbole that is likely to surround the quincentenary.

Particular attention should be given to the following:

1. *Columbus did not discover a new world and, thus, initiate American history.*
Neither did the Vikings nor did the seafaring Africans, Chinese, Pacific Islanders, or other people who may have preceded the Vikings. The land that Columbus encountered was not a new world. Rather, it was a world of peoples with rich and complex histories dating back at least 15,000 years or possibly earlier. On that fateful morning of October 12, 1492, Columbus did not discover a new world. He put, rather, as many historians have accurately observed, two old worlds into permanent contact.
2. *The real America Columbus encountered in 1492 was a different place from the pre-contact America often portrayed in folklore, textbooks, and the mass media.*
The America of 1492 was not a wilderness inhabited by primitive peoples whose history was fundamentally different from that of the peoples of the Eastern Hemisphere. Many of the same phenomena characterized, rather, the history of the peoples of both the Western and the Eastern Hemispheres, including; highly developed agricultural systems, centers of dense populations, complex civilizations, large-scale empires, extensive networks of long-distance trade and cultural diffusion, complex patterns of interstate conflict and cooperation, sophisticated systems of religious and scientific belief, extensive linguistic diversity, and regional variations in levels of societal complexity.
3. *Africa was very much a part of the social, economic, and political system of the Eastern Hemisphere in 1492.*
The Atlantic slave trade, which initially linked western Africa to Mediterranean Europe and the Atlantic islands, soon extended to the Americas. Until the end of the 18th century, the number of Africans who crossed the Atlantic to the Americas exceeded the number of Europeans. The labor, experiences and cultures of the African-American people, throughout enslavement as well as after emancipation, have been significant in shaping the economic, political, and social history of the United States.
4. *The encounters of Native Americans, Africans, and Europeans following 1492 are not stories of vigorous white actors confronting passive red and black spectators and victims.*
Moreover, these were not internally homogeneous groups, but represented a diversity of peoples with varied cultural traditions, economic structures, and political systems. All parties pursued their interests as they perceived them – sometimes independently of the interests of others, sometimes in collaboration with others, and sometimes in conflict with others. All borrowed from and influenced the others and, in turn, were influenced by them. The internal diversity of the Native Americans, the Africans, and the Europeans contributed to the development of modern American pluralistic culture and contemporary world civilization.
5. *As a result of forces emanating from 1492, Native Americans suffered catastrophic mortality rates.*
By far the greatest contributors to this devastation were diseases brought by the explorers and those who came after. The micro-organisms associated with diseases such as smallpox, measles, whooping cough, chicken pox, and influenza had not evolved in the Americas; hence, the indigenous peoples had no immunity to these diseases when the Europeans and Africans arrived. These diseases were crucial allies in the European conquest of the Native American.

The ensuing wars between rival European nations that were played out in this hemisphere, the four centuries of Indian and European conflicts, as well as the now well-documented instances of genocidal and displacement policies of the colonial and post colonial governments further contributed to the most extensive depopulation of a group of peoples in the history of humankind.

Despite this traumatic history of destruction and deprivation, Native American peoples have endured and are experiencing a cultural resurgence as we observe the 500th anniversary of the encounter.

6. *Columbus's voyages were not just a European phenomenon, but, rather, were a facet of Europe's millennia-long history of interaction with Asia and Africa.*
The "discovery" of America was an unintended outcome of Iberian Europe's search for an all-sea route to the "Indies"— a search stimulated in large part by the disruption of European-Asian trade routes, occasioned by the collapse of the Mongul Empire. Technology critical the Columbus's voyages, such as the compass, the sternpost rudder, gunpowder, and paper, originated in China. The lateen sail, along with much of the geographical knowledge on which Columbus relied, originated with or was transmitted by the Arabs.

7. *Although most examinations of the United States' historical connections to the Eastern Hemisphere tend to focus on northwestern Europe, Spain and Portugal also had extensive effects on the Americas.*
From the Columbian voyages through exploration, conquest, religious conversion, settlement, and the development of Latin-American mestizo cultures, Spain and Portugal had a continuing influence on life in the American continents.

The Enduring Legacy of 1492

Certain events in human history change forever our conception of who we are and how we see the world. Such events not only change our maps of the world, they alter our mental landscapes as well. The event of 500 years ago, when a small group of Europeans, and, soon after, Africans, encountered Native Americans is of this magnitude.

Educators contribute to the commemoration of the quincentenary in intellectually significant and educationally appropriate ways when they assist students in becoming knowledgeable about this event and about its critical role in shaping contemporary America as a universal nation within an interdependent world.

This statement, which was nearly a year in development, has also received the endorsement of 30 other national groups, including the American Indian Heritage Foundation, learned societies, and education groups.

Practical Guidelines for Teaching about Columbus

“‘In fourteen ninety two ...’ (Come on, everyone sing along), ‘Columbus sailed the ocean blue.’... I still have vivid memories of my kindergarten classroom with the silhouettes of all the heroes that we should admire so diligently cut out by a teacher whose name I forget. We had to memorize these heroes’ names and to label their silhouettes. It must have been an effective way to learn, because whenever I think of Columbus, I do not see one of the many painted interpretations of what he looked like; rather, I still see his little silhouette and hear the little jingle learned in kindergarten” (Pahl, 1992, p. 27).

Vivid kindergarten memories are poignant reminders to primary teachers that the images we help young people form are often enduring lessons. One of the major problems teachers face in helping students form a more accurate image of Christopher Columbus is the inadequacy of old books and materials and the lack of new materials to replace them. *And new books may or may not be accurate.* In addition, much of what is known about Columbus and his impact on the Native people of the Western Hemisphere is violent and often inappropriate for very young children.

How can teachers use the old materials that lurk in school libraries in more effective ways? How can educators teach about Columbus in an intellectually honest and ethical manner? How can we begin to evaluate newly published materials? The following suggestions can be helpful when using outdated books, evaluating new instructional materials, and teaching about Columbus in an accurate and developmentally appropriate way.

1. Stress that the story about Columbus is usually told from an European point-of-view and that the Native people experienced his arrival differently.
2. Do not use the term “discover.” This implies that these continents were void of rich civilizations that had developed over millennium.
3. Differentiate between Columbus the sailor and Columbus the man. Columbus was a courageous sailor; he was a greedy, disturbed, and violent man.
4. Emphasize the richness of the Native cultures that were in the Americas in 1492, dispelling the concept of “savage, uncivilized” people. Guard against these stereotypes and inaccuracies which are common in older books for children.
5. Tell children that most of the people who warmly greeted Columbus died — either because of the cruel treatment by the Spaniards or from European diseases.
6. Teach about the gifts that the Native peoples of these continents gave to the world.
7. Remind children that it has been 500 years since Columbus landed and that Native people and cultures are alive and are still contributing in many ways to the world.

8. Teach that we *commemorate* or remember this historical event — the coming together of two worlds — but that we cannot *celebrate* the devastation of Native cultures.

Pahl, R. H. (1992, January/February). How should we teach about Columbus — as a hero or a villain? A commentary on Hans Koning's *Columbus: His enterprise: Exploding the myth*. *Social Studies*, p. 27.

Choosing Instructional Materials for Teaching about Columbus

- | | Yes | Somewhat* | No |
|---|-----|-----------|----|
| 1. Does the material emphasize that Columbus did <i>not</i> "discover" a <i>new</i> world? | | | |
| 2. Does the material speculate on Columbus' motives? | | | |
| 3. Does the material present an accurate picture of America in 1492, free of folklore, distortion, and stereotyping? | | | |
| 4. Does the material tell the story from more than just the European point of view? Are Native peoples' perspective on the encounter included? | | | |
| 5. Does the material include information important for a complete understanding of the voyages and their impact on the Native people? | | | |
| 6. Do the illustrations depict a fair and unbiased representation of Columbus, his men, the King and Queen of Spain, and the Native people? | | | |
| 7. Does the material emphasize the interconnectedness of the history of the world that began to emerge in 1492? | | | |
| 8. Does the material acknowledge that Africa was part of the social, economic, and political system of the Eastern Hemisphere in 1492? | | | |
| 9. Does the material resist stereotyping Native Americans and Africans as passive spectators and victims at the hands of vigorous white Europeans? | | | |
| 10. Does the material identify the catastrophic mortality rates Native Americans suffered as a result of the encounter? | | | |
| 11. Does the material consider Columbus's voyages in the context of Europe's interaction with Asia and Africa, and not simply as a European phenomenon? | | | |
| 12. Does the material stress that Spain and Portugal, and not only northwestern Europe, had an extensive effect on the Americas? | | | |

* Materials that *somewhat* meet the criteria should be used with great care. Teachers should point out errors, using the opportunity to discuss common misconceptions, distortions, and omissions, and to present new, more complete and accurate information.

Network of Educators on Central America. (1991). Columbus textbook evaluation: Questions to think about. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus's arrival in America*. [Special issue]. (1991) *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI.

Wooster, J. S. (1992, April/May). Choosing materials for teaching about the Columbian Quincentenary. *Social Education*, 56(4), pp. 244-249.

Teaching Plans for 1992 and Beyond

The following plans are meant to be flexible guidelines for teaching significant content about Christopher Columbus and the Native peoples of North and South America in historically accurate and culturally sensitive ways. Although they were created to assist teachers in teaching about the Quincentennial, they are intended to be used long past 1992.

Recognizing that teachers have different academic and experiential backgrounds, prefer particular methods of teaching, and must adapt materials to meet the special needs of their distinctive grade levels and the unique characteristics of their students, some plans are quite specific, and others are more general. These plans, developed by different people, encourage teachers to expand their own knowledge and teach in new ways. They all present significant ideas that can be taught using a wide variety of strategies and resources.

Teachers are invited to use these teaching plans as guidelines, adapting them as needed, in order to present an accurate story of the landing of Columbus, as well as the enduring reality of the positive and negative aspects of his legacy on the indigenous peoples, the original inhabitants of the Western Hemisphere.

Teaching about Columbus in the Primary Grades

Grade Level: Primary (K-3)

Culture Area: All culture areas of North America, including the Circum-Caribbean culture area

Time Period: Pre-1492 contact period to the present

Background: In teaching about Columbus, it is important to be aware that young children are still struggling to learn abstract, relational concepts of time and space — “long, long ago” is difficult for them to understand as are continents, nations, and “across the ocean.” Teachers should make every effort to be as concrete as possible, using familiar analogies and examples to teach about unfamiliar times, places, people, and ideas. Maps and globes, pictures, videos, and filmstrips are also important in helping children learn abstract concepts. It is also important to teach children about the realities of history. It is never too early to teach respect for other cultures and how to think critically about complex issues.

For years we have taught young children that Christopher Columbus “discovered” America. The following lessons are designed to help children understand that thousands of indigenous people occupied the Western Hemisphere in highly organized societies, living in harmony with nature and each other. During pre-Columbian times, more than 400 different languages were spoken on the North American continent alone. Although a wide range of customs, lifeways, and languages existed, many similarities were present among all Native American peoples.

Books for children about Christopher Columbus perpetuate inaccuracies and stereotypes and ignore significant issues such as racism and colonialism. They also seemingly accept that it is the right of white people to rule over people of color and for powerful nations to dominate others as they choose. Inaccurate books and other teaching materials can help condition children to accept inequality and ethnocentrism. Such materials convey that it is justified to take people’s land if you’re more “civilized” or have a “better” religion.

The suggested teaching plans provide an opportunity to examine our approaches to teaching not only about Christopher Columbus, but about indigenous peoples and other oppressed and silenced people.

The Environment

Grade Level: Primary (K-3)

Basic Concepts: Natural and physical environment, change, interdependence

Organizing Generalizations: Depending on what the teacher chooses to emphasize, this lesson can be used to teach one or more social science generalizations: (1) When the two old worlds came together, both of the worlds changed in many ways, (2) Everything in nature is interdependent, and (3) Individual acts can make a difference in preserving and protecting the earth.

Background: Over 500 separate nations, with their own languages and lifeways, were here when Columbus arrived. The Europeans and the Indian people had different ways of life and valued different things. The European people, because of their greater power, forced Indian people to make changes in the ways they lived and worked. They also brought new plants, animals, and ways of treating the earth. The positive results of the encounter that began with Columbus (e.g. the introduction of horses, sheep, cattle) don't offset the death and destruction that accompanied the Europeans.

The arrival of the Europeans changed the environment in fundamental ways. These changes have continued to this day, and they are changes that are hurting the earth.

Objectives:

Knowledge (Content) — Students will:

1. list ways the environment changed after the Europeans came to the Americas,
2. recognize the respect and appreciation Native Americans have always had for the earth, and
3. discuss the interdependence of all things in nature.

Skills — Students will:

1. use skills of inference to understand a traditional Lakota Indian saying and
2. work cooperatively to plan a project that will help the earth.

Values (Organic) — Students will:

1. appreciate the wisdom and value of traditional North American Indian lifeways and
2. recognize that each person has a responsibility to care for Mother Earth.

Activities:

1. Read one or more of the following books to the students:

Jeffers, S. (1992). *Brother eagle, sister sky: A message from Chief Seattle*. New York, NY: Dial.

MacGill-Callahan, S. (1991). *And still the turtle watched*. New York, NY: Dial.

Cherry, L. (1992). *A river ran wild*. New York, NY: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

2. Using the books and the illustrations, discuss Native Americans' traditional relationship to the earth and how the environment changed when the Europeans came. These changes should be listed on a chart or chalkboard. Help children to understand that a difference in the values and worldview of the Europeans and Native Americans can explain many of these changes.
3. Explore why Native Americans refer to our planet as "Mother Earth." List the gifts of the earth which we could not live without.
4. Some tribes such as the Lakota declare *Mitakuye Oyasin*, which means "We are all related." Discuss what that means. Ask children to role-play how we could show appreciation and respect for all things in nature. Make a list of the ideas that students generate.
5. Encourage students to consider the condition of Mother Earth today (this could be integrated with science lessons).
6. Plan a class project that would have a positive impact on the environment.

Evaluation:

Students should be able to discuss the need for respect for all people and the lands upon which they live.

Additional Appropriate Activities and Extensions:

1. The Iroquois Great law of Peace says "Everyone has a responsibility to help preserve the earth, Our Mother, for the benefit of her children seven generations to come." Discuss what this would mean in the decisions we make each day.
2. Use this lesson to develop science lessons on conservation.
3. Read *Thanking the Birds* by Joseph Bruchac and discuss the meaning of the story and how each of us can show respect for all living things.

Bruchac, J. (1991). Thanking the birds. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus' arrival in America*. [Special issue] (1991). *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI. p. 11. (Excerpted from the afterword to Caduto, M.J., & Bruchac, J. (1988). *Keepers of the earth, Native American stories and environmental activities for children*. Golden, CO: Fulcrum, Inc.)

4. Twenty-six states have names of Native American origin. Use a map of the United States to locate them. Plan with students how they could discover what the names mean and the tribe from which the word came?

Resources:

Teachers will want to find books about Native Americans which further illustrate their respect for the earth as well as contemporary books related to environmental concerns. The following resources are particularly recommended for teachers:

- Bruchac, J. (1991). Thanking the birds. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus' arrival in America*. [Special issue] (1991). *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI. p. 11. (Excerpted from the afterword to Caduto, M.J., & Bruchac, J. (1988). *Keepers of the earth, Native American stories and environmental activities for children*. Golden, CO: Fulcrum, Inc.)
- Cherry, L. (1992). *A river ran wild: An environmental history*. New York, NY: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- Crosby, A. W. (1972). *The Columbian exchange: Biological and cultural consequences of 1492*. Westport, CT: Greenwood.
- Jeffers, S. (1992). *Brother eagle, sister sky: A message from Chief Seattle*. New York, NY: Dial.
- MacGill-Callahan, S. (1991). *And still the turtle watched*. New York, NY: Dial.
- Weatherford, J. (1988). *Indian givers: How the Indians of the Americas transformed the world*. New York, NY: Fawcet Book Group.

The Meeting

Grade Level: Primary (K-3)

Basic Concept: Historical bias

Organizing Generalizations: Any event is perceived differently by the people who observe or participate in the event. Historical accounts are presented through the perspective of the people who report the event.

Background: Children find it difficult to understand that there are multiple perspectives. Developmentally, it is important for them to learn that there are diverse points-of-view and perhaps, more importantly, to question what they read and are told. The European account of the landing of Columbus is quite different from a Native American account. Although primary children are too young to fully understand all of the following information, they can consider why the encounter with the Europeans was not an event celebrated by the indigenous people of the Americas.

- It is estimated that 90% of the Caribbean Indian population died within the first century after the arrival of the Europeans. Smallpox, measles, chicken pox, and typhoid diseases served to decimate entire nations of people who were unable to protect themselves against these European diseases.
- Columbus kidnapped some Indians to take back to Spain on his first voyage. His second trip resulted in 550 captives being taken back to Spain as slaves. The ships would only hold that many of the 1600 people that he initially captured. Within the first decade of Columbus' arrival, the Spanish had shipped out between 3,000 and 6,000 Indian slaves to Seville. Many times that number were enslaved for use in early mines and plantations of the Caribbean. The slave trade became less profitable than gold when the Spanish began their conquest of the mainlands.
- Gold was prized by Indians in an aesthetic or spiritual sense rather than a monetary sense. However, the conquistadors, who had other values, melted down the highly prized golden objects they took from the Natives and sent gold bars to Spain. Between 1500 and 1650, gold from the Americas added at least 180-200 tons of gold to European coffers. It was this greed for gold, rather than the desire for silver, spices or the conversion of souls to Christianity, that spurred discovery and conquest in the Americas.
- An entire civilization of Native people on the island of Hispaniola was wiped out in 40 years of Spanish administration. Few Native children who witnessed Columbus' arrival in the Americas grew to adulthood. By the year 1500, the Spanish Crown determined that Columbus was too harsh with the Spanish colonists and Indians. The third voyage of Columbus ended with him being sent back to Spain in chains.

Objectives:

Knowledge (Content) — Students will:

1. describe the encounter between Columbus and the indigenous populations from the Native American perspective,
2. describe how the land was illegally and dishonestly taken from the Native peoples, and
3. discuss the meaning of *accuracy*, *omission*, *myth*, and *bias*.

Skills — Students will:

1. compare two perspectives on the arrival of Columbus in the Americas and
2. analyze the events from both the European and Native perspectives.

Values (Organic) — Students will:

1. begin to understand that information that is printed is not always accurate since it is reported through one or more person's perspective,
2. recognize the need to view any event from a variety of perspectives, and
3. accept the need to modify opinions based on new information.

Activities:

1. Before initiating studies related to Columbus, ask students to brainstorm a list of words that describe Christopher Columbus and a list of words that describe Indians. Post these lists in a prominent place. When the study concludes, review these lists, asking children if they would change them in any way. You will probably want to create new lists demonstrating new learning.
2. Read *Encounter* by Jane Yolen. This book presents a Native American perspective and presents an opportunity for children to be critical readers and thinkers as well as to develop their ability to take the perspective of another. Encourage students to think about how the same events are understood differently by different people and to look for accuracy, omissions, myth, and balance. Should we always believe what we read or hear?

Yolen, J. (1992). *Encounter*. New York, NY: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

3. Discuss why you feel Columbus thought he could claim land for Spain when there were people living here already.
4. Using the background information and what students already know about fairness, cooperation, respect, and honoring differences, discuss how the arrival of Christopher Columbus must have appeared to the Native people already living here. What did they see, what did they think was happening, and how did they feel?

5. Make a large mural that depicts how both Indian people and the Spanish might have viewed the arrival of Columbus' ships and write a story that describes what the feelings might have been from both perspectives.

Evaluation:

The mural should represent a reasonable depiction of a Native perspective of the encounter as well as a European perspective.

Additional Appropriate Activities and Extensions:

1. Older children can also discuss how the victor in any encounter is the one who writes or tells the history. The concept of historical bias can be introduced to children in any number of other concrete ways.
2. The more mature students may want to review several children's books about Columbus and compare them with *Encounter*.
3. Write a skit that demonstrates an example of the word encounter and one that demonstrates an example of the word discover.

Resources:

Yolen, J. (1992). *Encounter*. New York, NY: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

It's Mine!

Grade Level: Primary (K-3)

Basic Concepts: Power, ownership

Organizing Generalizations: Throughout time, people who have power have claimed the lands of others of lesser power.

Background: Although the Europeans were initially welcomed, it soon became evident that their arrival was not good for the indigenous people of North and South America. European diseases substantially weakened the Native people, making it difficult for them to resist invasion and conquest. The Spaniards were cruel in achieving their goals, and the Europeans who had the advantage of horses and guns eventually claimed the lives and lands of Native peoples.

Cautionary Note: The following are simulation activities. It is critical that appropriate arrangements are made with school administrators, parents, and other teachers. The activities are not designed to frighten children, but rather to present the other side of the encounter. Do these activities only to the degree that children are emotionally and cognitively mature enough to experience some discomfort. Teachers may want to discuss the purpose of the lessons with the students before beginning the activities.

Objectives:

Knowledge (Content) — Students will:

1. understand that Columbus and other European explorers took land, possessions, and people as slaves that were not theirs to take,
2. recognize that disease was a major factor in making it possible for Native people to succumb to the Europeans, and
3. distinguish between lawful and unlawful (honest and dishonest) assumption of the property of another.

Skills — Students will:

1. make conclusions based upon personal experience and
2. extrapolate from personal experience to other similar events and circumstances.

Values (Organic) — Students will:

1. recognize unfair behavior against another and
2. begin to understand the sadness, anger, and resentment of Native people regarding the loss of their ancestral lands.

Activities:

1. Have an individual or group claim a corner of your classroom for their own use. Perhaps, have them increase their territory over a period of time while diminish-

ing the space left for your students. Depending on the age of your students, the following aspects can be added.

- The invading students are unable to communicate verbally.
 - They kidnap a few of your students to sharpen their pencils, carry their books, run errands, or get supplies.
 - They begin to claim supplies, books, pencils, markers and other things in the room for their personal use.
 - They force “trades” of their useless items for things of value that belong to your students.
 - By putting a colored sticker on the arm of people they come in contact with, they “infect” them with fatal diseases.
2. The teacher, can claim an item of some value or importance that belongs to a student. Take it for his/her own use.
 3. Students will quickly become dismayed with any of these events. Relate the activity to the Columbian encounter with Native peoples. Discuss fairness and the meaning of ownership. Is it right to take something that belongs to someone else and claim it as your own? When that happens, how do people on both sides feel? What makes people think that it is acceptable to take other people’s things?

Evaluation:

In the debriefing of the simulation, students will explore the issue of whether or not it is right or ethical to take the property of another.

Additional Appropriate Activities and Extensions:

Read *The People Shall Continue* by Simon Ortiz. It is important for children to know that, despite invasion and conquest, the Native people are a living part of our culture today.

Resources:

Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus’ arrival in America. [Special issue] (1991). *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI.

Ortiz, S. (1988). *The people shall continue* (revised). San Francisco, CA: Children’s Book Press.

Teaching about Columbus in the Intermediate Grades Preserving History

Grade Level: Intermediate (Grades 4-6)

Basic Concept: Alternative ways of preserving history of nations.

Organizing Generalizations: There are many ways to transfer history from one generation to the next. Not all history is written, and other traditional methods of recording and recounting history have equal validity.

Culture Area: Meso-American and Circum-Caribbean Culture areas

Time Period: Pre-1492 contact period to the present

Background: History has generally been told by people who have a written language. History can also be perceived and interpreted from many different individual, cultural, political, and social perspectives. In addition, those who conquer others usually write the history, leaving the conquered people little chance to tell their story. Over 500 separate nations were here when Columbus arrived. Each nation had its own origin, important legends and stories, methods for documenting important events and of passing on their own nation's history from one generation to the next. Children need to understand that history is complex and that there are many perspectives on the same event. Also, these histories are remembered and retold in a variety of ways.

Objectives:

Knowledge (Content) — Students will:

1. demonstrate, through methods other than writing, their understanding of the events of the encounter of Columbus and the Native people and
2. demonstrate a variety of ways by which history and tradition can be passed from one generation to the next (e.g., stories, songs, wampum, pictographs, petroglyphs, and winter counts).

Skills — Students will:

1. use library and research skills,
2. hypothesize about how the Native inhabitants of the Circum-Caribbean area might have recorded the history of the landing of Columbus and his four voyages, and
3. creatively record events in ways other than writing.

Values (Organic) — Students will:

1. appreciate the variety of ways that people or nations transmit their history and traditions and

2. accept the validity of a variety of forms of historical records.

Activities:

1. Teachers should prepare a bulletin board that demonstrates the variety of ways that history can be recorded other than by written records. American Indian peoples have used rich oral traditions, songs, wampum, pictographs, petroglyphs, art, and winter counts to record historical events and to pass their history and cultures. Contemporary methods of recording historical or important events include traditional and technological methods such as video, photographs, art, music, and stories.
2. Discuss how the stories we have learned about Columbus and his voyages are derived from written records and, therefore, express the perspectives of Europeans, not the perspectives of Native people.
3. Divide students into research teams to study various parts of Columbus' voyages. The teams will record summaries of these events on a large classroom time line.
4. Using the events recorded on the time line, review with students the facts that we know about these events through the written records of the Europeans — both positive and negative accounts. So many Native people were killed or died that we do not have their story. The few that survived did not leave written records.
5. Ask students to take the place of the surviving Natives and individually record one of the major events in a form that does not use written language.
6. After displaying and reviewing the non-written stories, take time to discuss what students learned about history and about perspective in this exercise. Summarize their statements on an overhead transparency or chalkboard.

Evaluation:

Ask students to individually write a brief "I learned" statement. Their statements should reflect an awareness of the validity of various methods of recording and recounting historical events.

Resources:

1. Have prepared examples of non-written historical records.
2. Students should have access to a substantial number of resource materials on the four voyages of Columbus.

Additional Appropriate Activities and Extensions:

1. Because the majority of the North American tribes had no written language, as we know it today, their unwritten record of certain events, frequently handed down orally, is often referred to as legend or myth. Research a legend for a tribe

in your state. Could that legend be based on actual events? In pairs, share your legend with the class, defending its historical validity.

2. Ask an American Indian elder to come to the class and talk about how they learned the history of their tribe. Students can also ask their parents, grandparents, or older adults to tell about a particular historical event as they experienced it. Do people remember the same things in the same way? Are their stories reasonable recounts of history?
3. Compare the legends of a variety of tribal groups. What lessons do they teach about the history of a tribe?
4. Research how history has been drawn, painted, or carved instead of written.
5. Ask students to create a diary of the important events in their individual lives in a way other than writing. If they decide to create a story, ask them to describe how they would memorize it and tell it to others in ways that would not change the story.
6. In some tribes, certain young people were trained from an early age to remember the important history of their tribes using various kinds of memory aids. Work with a partner to develop memory aids and memorize a legend so that you can tell it correctly to other people.
7. Wampum was used as a memory device — create an object that would help others remember a particular event in history.

Teaching about Columbus in the Intermediate Grades Biological and Cultural Change

Grade Level: Intermediate (Grades 4-6)

Basic Concepts: Biological and cultural change

Organizing Generalizations: When two cultures come in contact, both cultures change. In the case of the contact between two old worlds, major changes occurred worldwide.

Culture Area: All culture areas of North America, including the Circum-Caribbean culture area

Time Period: Pre-1492 contact period to the present

Background: The first voyage of Columbus had an enormous impact on the world. Cultures changed; the land, vegetation, and cultivated crops changed; animals changed; population sizes and racial composition changed; and our knowledge of the size of the world changed. The results of the encounter of the two old worlds and the subsequent changes that occurred had both positive and negative effects that have endured to the present.

Objectives:

Knowledge (Content) — Students will:

1. understand that there were many nations of people here before the arrival of Christopher Columbus,
2. discuss the “imports” and “exports” that resulted from the encounter between Indian people and Columbus,
3. describe the adverse effects of the transmission of European diseases to the Native populations of North and South America, and
4. discuss how these “imports” and “exports” impacted the world in negative and positive ways.

Skills — Students will:

1. develop time lines as a tool for understanding the sequence of events and to locate these events in a continuum of time,
2. use maps to understand location and to present information visually, and
3. analyze the long-term effects of the encounter.

Values (Organic) — Students will:

1. empathize with the loss that Indian people experienced when their nations were diminished by disease, loss of land, genocide, and slavery,
2. appreciate the gifts of the Indian people to the world, and

3. understand the desire of contemporary nations of Indian people to maintain their cultural identities through language, dance, songs, traditions, and tribal self-governance.

Activities:

1. As a class, complete a time line that shows the arrival of Columbus in the Western Hemisphere. Ensure that the historical events in North America and Europe, both before and after 1492, are displayed and studied. Discuss the influences impacting each hemisphere immediately prior to the encounter. How did knowledge, developed through trade, of Asian technical inventions, such as the mariner's compass, the sternpost rudder, gunpowder, and paper, and the printing press developed in Europe impact the voyages? It is important to point out that, contrary to many of the Columbus stories, most people in Europe did acknowledge that the world was undoubtedly round, not flat.
2. Compare maps of the world before the voyage of Columbus, after his first voyage, after the fourth voyage, and today. This is an opportunity to study the history of maps and how they changed with new knowledge of the size and shape of the earth. Introduce the idea that not only did our knowledge of the world change as a result of the voyages of Columbus, but other major changes occurred which dramatically altered the world and the lives of the people.
3. Introduce the "seeds of change" (the horse, the potato, corn, sugar, and disease), five major ways, identified by the Smithsonian Institution, that the populations of the world were changed by the encounter. Form student groups to research these five "seeds of change." On individual maps chart the directions of these changes — east to west and west to east. Groups should give reports that present the effects of these changes.
4. Based upon new knowledge, students should decide which changes were negative and which were positive. Older students should also discuss how these changes are part of the legacy of Columbus and the results of these changes endure today.

Resources:

- Bigelow, B. (1991). Timeline: Spain, Columbus and Native Americans. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus' arrival in America*. [special issue]. *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee: WI.
- Charging Eagle, T., & Zeilinger, R. (1987). *Black Hills: Scared hills*. Chamberlain, SD: Tipi Press.
- Crosby, A. W. (1972). *The Columbian exchange: Biological and cultural consequences of 1492*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.
- Palmer, C. (1992, September). African slave trade: The cruelest commerce. *National Geographic*, 182(3), pp. 62-91.

Seeds of change: The story of cultural exchange after 1492. Menlo Park, CA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co. (96 page text with teacher's guide for grades 5-8, available from Addison-Wesley, 2725 Sand Hill Rd., Menlo Park, CA 94025, 800-447-2226).

Seeds of change: Readings in cultural exchange after 1492. Menlo Park, CA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co. (128 page text with teacher's guide for high school grades, available from Addison-Wesley, 2725 Sand Hill Rd., Menlo Park, CA 94025, 800-447-2226).

Thornton, R. (1987). *American Indian holocaust and survival: A population history since 1492.* Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press.

Viola, H.J., & Margolis, C. (Eds.). (1991). *Seeds of change: A Quincentennial commemoration.* Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian.

Waldman, C. (1985). *Atlas of the North American Indian.* New York, NY: Facts on File.

Weatherford, J. (1988). *Indian givers: How the Indians of the Americas transformed the world.* New York, NY: Fawcett Book Group.

Weatherford, J. (1991). *Native roots: How the Indians enriched America.* New York, NY: Crown.

Evaluation:

The discussion of students should identify some of the major positive and negative changes that occurred throughout the world as a result of the encounter and exhibit knowledge of the enduring impact of the cultural and biological changes.

Additional Appropriate Activities and Extensions:

1. Chart the populations of Spain and North America (or the United States) before the voyage of Columbus, fifty years after the first voyage, 200 years later, and today. Noted author Howard Zinn estimated that 9 million Native people were destroyed within forty years of 1492. Help younger students to understand this number in more concrete terms by comparing the population of their own community to the numbers of Native people who died.
2. Older students should have the opportunity to discuss the reasons for the decline in the Native populations up until the early 1900s. Be prepared to discuss why populations declined so dramatically as a result of disease, mistreatment, genocidal practices (horrible punishments, forced labor, malnutrition, torture, diseases, and warfare).
3. Locate maps from the Bureau of Indian Affairs or other sources that depict U.S. tribal populations, locations, and land areas prior to 1492, in the 1700s, 1800s and today. Research and graph the amount of acreage lost to the tribes. Read Indian newspapers to gather information about one contemporary land dispute such as the Navajo — Hopi land dispute in Arizona or the Sioux dispute with the federal government over the Black Hills in South Dakota.

Charging Eagle, T., & Zeilinger, R. (1987). *Black Hills: Scared hills*. Chamberlain, SD: Tipi Press.

Waldman, C. (1985). *Atlas of the North American Indian*. New York, NY: Facts on File.

4. Have students prepare an exhibit, mural, or a meal that presents the gifts that the Indian people of North and South American gave the world.
5. Older students can research the history of slavery in Africa and Europe before and immediately after 1492.

Palmer, C. (1992, September). African slave trade: The cruelest commerce. *National Geographic*, 182(3), pp. 62-91.

Teaching about Columbus in the Middle School

How Historical Inaccuracies Impact the Present

Grade Level: Middle/Junior High School (Grades 7-9)

Basic Concept: Historical inaccuracies

Organizing Generalizations: Our knowledge about people and events is often limited to what we read about them. We frequently lack direct contact and experience. Our attitudes and behaviors can thus be influenced by another's perspective on different people and significant historical events.

Culture Area: All culture areas of North America, including the Circum-Caribbean culture area

Time Period: Pre-1492 contact period to the present

Background: Maritime exploration has long been an activity engaged in by numerous countries. Some researchers suggest that there is evidence that many explorers landed in the Western Hemisphere long before Columbus, such as second century Jews, Chinese Buddhist (in Mexico), an Irish monk, Prince Madoc of Wales, and Leif Eriksson. The competition to cross the Atlantic in the 1400s alone could be compared to the modern-day race into space. Yet little attention is paid these pre-Columbian explorers; their exploits have gone almost unnoticed. The written history of North America would be altered were we to acknowledge and accurately record their expeditions.

The Genoese mariner, Cristoforo Colombo, is generally given sole credit for having located the Western Hemisphere, which was irreversibly changed as a result. Unique aspects of the four Columbian voyages were his manner of forcibly subduing local indigenous populations and bringing thousands of Europeans to the Caribbean islands to colonize them. These early acts of violent colonization and land acquisition continue to have ramifications in the 20th Century among indigenous populations in such countries as El Salvador, Guatemala, Nicaragua, Brazil, as well as Africa and Australia. If we are ever to achieve a measure of global peace, we must begin by acknowledging past behaviors, improving upon them, and learning acceptance and the ability to co-exist in harmony.

Objectives:

Knowledge (Content) — Students will:

1. learn about other explorers to the Western Hemisphere prior to Columbus and
2. research the explorer after whom America was named.

Skills — Students will:

1. learn to write objectively and persuasively,
2. apply research and analytic skills,

3. learn and use debating skills, and
4. engage in critical thinking.

Values (Organic) — Students will:

1. understand the value of honesty and of giving credit where it is due and
2. consider reasons why historical events are not always described accurately in textbooks.

Activities:

1. The teacher should gather as many books and other resource materials as possible, from the school library and outside sources, on the topic of the earliest explorers to the Western Hemisphere prior to Columbus.
2. Divide the class into 6 cooperative working groups. Five groups will research the following pre-Columbian expeditions: second-century Jews, Chinese Buddhists, Irish Monk(s), Prince of Madoc of Wales, and Lief Eriksson — one expedition for each group. The sixth group will research Amerigo Vespucci, whose first name was altered slightly and taken as the name for this continent.
3. Each group summarizes their major findings. A spokesperson for each group shares their findings with the whole class.
4. Briefly discuss why we know so little about pre-Columbian explorers to the Western Hemisphere. Why do textbooks not provide more information about them? Why do we overlook Leif Eriksson Day, created by Congress on October 9, 1964?
5. Turn the compiled class research over to the editor of your school newspaper, as well as the local newspaper, for publication, in each case asking for comments. It is likely the research will contain new information to many readers.
6. Clip and display on a bulletin board all resulting letters to the editor or other written commentary.

Evaluation:

Students will be evaluated on the quantity and quality of their contribution to the small group work, including researching, writing, and/or presenting their findings. Did the post-presentation discussion indicate an awareness of new historical information and spark questions about the limited content in most textbooks?

Resources:

Students should have access to a substantial number of books, encyclopedias, and other resource materials on early explorers to the Western Hemisphere, such as the following:

Boorstein, D. (1985). *The discoverers*. New York, NY: Vintage.

Kalosh, A. (1991). Sailing with a Viking. *World Monitor*, September, 22(6).

Additional Appropriate Activities or Extensions:

1. Imagine that Leif Eriksson's small colony in L'Anse-aux-Meadows, Newfoundland, in northeastern Canada, had survived, and more Nordic people each year since 1000 A.D. arrived in North America. Learn as much as you can about the lifestyles and values of Nordic countries. Script an imaginary scenario about the interaction and cultural exchange, including religions, that might have developed between the Vikings and the Native communities. Describe how having primarily Nordic ancestors might have altered the face of contemporary North American life. Role play an altered, Viking-influenced lifestyle in 1992 before another class.
2. A reason often cited for exploring uncharted territories is to seek more people to convert to one group's religion of preference. Textbooks often claim one reason for Columbus' enthusiasm to sail the Atlantic was to convert those he found to Catholicism. Yet, due to cruel treatment, murder, disease, and mass suicides, few Natives were converted. A closer analysis of historical events in Columbus' day also reveals the fact that there was an economically driven eagerness to find a fast trade route to the Orient. Commerce outweighed Christianity as a motive. Why do you suppose writers of the 15th Century — as well as some contemporary authors — don't divulge the commercial intent of Columbus' voyages and prefer to depict them as a mission for the Catholic Church or idealistically as pure exploration? Discuss. List all possible explanations. Write individual letters to Columbus expressing your personal opinions about his motives.
3. When gold and spices were found to be disappointingly rare in the Caribbean, Columbus had to maintain his promise to the King and Queen of Spain to present them with "as much gold as they needed." So he initiated the slave trade in this hemisphere. He'd previously become acquainted with the slave trade on travels south from Portugal to the African coast. A second reason Columbus was eager to ensure the voyages were profitable was that he'd demanded, in a contract with the Spanish Court, 10% of all resources located in the unknown lands for himself and his heirs in perpetuity. Define and discuss the term *in perpetuity*. Research what the 500 Indian slaves kidnapped on the second voyage might have sold for in 1495, assuming they all survived. Determine Columbus' profit for life. Also, survey a minimum of 5 adults each about how many of them are aware of the connection between Columbus and the slave trade. Summarize and chart the results for the class.
4. On the first voyage, Columbus, then aged 41, referred to the Taíno Indians and other local tribes in his journal as: "naturally kind, trustworthy, humble, simple, gentle, and very clever." In his journal entry of November 12, 1492, he wrote: "They are very gentle and without knowledge of what is evil; nor do they murder." Yet he later began stories of cannibals when referring to the Carib Indian of Cuba and Haiti. These stories were challenged by the priest-historian

Bartolomé de las Casas, who made a hand-written copy of Columbus' original log shortly after the voyages. Contemporary author Frederick Sale states the reports of purported cannibalism by the Indians was a ploy to justify enslaving and murdering the Caribbean people whose lands were desired. Discuss how these early negative depictions of Native peoples continue today. Cite specific negative references and stereotypes you have heard or read in your lifetime. Postulate what purpose they have served. Brainstorm ways such negative stereotypes can be eradicated. Act on two of your ideas. Two suggested resources follow:

Sale, F. (1991). *The conquest of paradise: Christopher Columbus and the Columbian legacy*. New York, NY: Dutton.

Slapin, B., & Seale, D. (Eds.). (1992). *Through Indian eyes: The Native experience in books for children*. Philadelphia, PA: New Society.

5. Columbus Day was first proclaimed by President Franklin Roosevelt in April, 1934, after intense lobbying by Italian-Americans. During the time of Columbus, the Julian calendar, dating from the time of Julius Caesar, was still in use. In 1492, the Julian calendar had accumulated ten days of error ahead of the actual date. The error was corrected in 1582 by simply deleting the accumulated extra 10 days from the month; October 4, 1582, was followed by October 15, 1582! We now use the Gregorian calendar created by Pope Gregory XIII. Thus, Columbus actually saw land on October 2, 1492, rather than on the erroneous Julian calendar date of October 12, 1492. Before conducting research on the history of Columbus Day, discuss what may have led to this holiday being proclaimed and why on October 12th instead of the actual date of October 2nd. Select two recorders to keep notes on the discussion. Why would we be interested in a man whose death at the age of 55, was not noted publicly in his adopted country, Spain, until 10 years after the fact? How might revering a man who never set foot in the United States be useful as a patriotic figure? Was the country in need of a patriotic "shot in the arm" in the 1930s? After conducting and summarizing your research on the background to the national holiday, compare the class' research with the notes of your discussion when you predicted possible reasons for the federal proclamation. Debate the pros and cons of the holiday in 1934 and in 1992. Is the justification for the holiday that was considered valid in 1934 still valid today? Students not engaged as debaters will judge each team on their presentation. A group of students may also want to research the history behind the Congressional proclamation of Lief Eriksson Day on October 9, 1964.
6. Discuss how visual images impact us daily. Cite examples of positive and negative symbols and images in magazines, on television, billboards, etc. Artists and photographers can convey subtle yet influential messages about the subjects depicted. Discuss why the usual artist's rendering of North American Indians is stereotypical, e.g., in an historical setting, a male figure wearing a feather headdress, etc. Gather textbooks and library books for various grade levels and critique the books for artwork, photography, and other visual images. What conclusions do you draw as a class? Next critique the books for written content

about Indians. Compare similarities and differences in findings. Share your findings with at least one other class and with the school librarian. Helpful articles are cited below:

Bigelow, B. (1990). Once upon a genocide: A review of Christopher Columbus in children's literature. In *Rethinking Schools*, 5(1), October/November. Milwaukee, WI.

Butterfield, R.A. (1983). The development and use of culturally appropriate curriculum for American Indian students. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 61(1), pp. 49-66.

Christensen, L. (1991). Unlearning myths that bind us: Students critiquing stereotypes in children's stories and films. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus' arrival in America. Rethinking Schools* [Special Issue]. Milwaukee, WI.

Napier, L. (1992). Hollywood's new treatment of Native American Indians: Fit for inclusion in the curriculum? *The Review of Education*, vol. 14

Slapin, B., et al. (1991). How to tell the difference: A checklist. In B. Slapin, & D. Seale (Eds.), *Through Indian eyes: The Native experience in books for children*. Philadelphia, PA: New Society.

7. It is well recognized that Indian people in North America have endured centuries of harsh treatment and oppression. Many people, Indian and non-Indian alike, believe the Columbian legacy of violent colonization and land acquisition has not entirely been eradicated. Tribal people continue to struggle to preserve their identity. Define the terms *assimilation* and *acculturation*. Which is more advantageous for Indian people if they are to survive culturally? Nationally, statistics for Indian people are disturbing. Generally, of all groups in the United States, Native people have the highest suicide and dropout rates, lowest income, shortest life span, poorest housing, etc. Divide the class into groups. One group researches national statistics, available through the U.S. Bureau of the Census. The other groups research current statistics for tribal groups and urban Native populations in and around the state. Share your findings. In a journal, write your feelings about these statistics for the point of view of a contemporary Indian survivor in 1992, inferring the influence those statistics have on your life. Two resources for national statistics on the 1980 Census and 1990 Census are cited below:

Hodgkinson, H., et al. (1990). *The demographics of American Indians: One percent of the people; fifty percent of the diversity*. Washington, D.C.: Institute for Educational Leadership. (Available also through the American Indian Science and Engineering Society, Boulder, CO. 303-492-8658) [For 1980 Census]

Charleston, G.M., & Lanser, M. (1992). *Briefing book III: National evaluation symposium*. Rockville, MD: U.S. Indian Health Service, Office of Planning, Evaluation and Legislation. (5600 Fishers Lane, Room 6-40, Parklawn Buiding, Rockville, MD 20857. (301-443-4700) [For 1990 Census].

8. Imagine that on a space mission in 1998 we encounter extra-terrestrials They are living peacefully on a nearby planet, which has resources valuable to the Earth. We have encountered a small party of them on an outpost, a satellite laboratory. Divide the class in two groups. One group is to plan an aggressive assault on the small community to take it by force with the ultimate goal of conquering the new planet. The second group will plan a peace-making mission with the ultimate goal of developing guidelines for peaceful co-existence and mutual assistance in the exploration of space. Each group is to build on the lessons from our past to plan their strategy. Summarize in writing the two plans of action. Share your results with at least one other class and discuss the two approaches.

Teaching about Columbus in High School Myths and Distortions of Fact

Grade Level: High School

Basic Concepts: Myths and distortions of fact and accuracy of historical information

Organizing Generalizations: Myths build up over time for both people and places. Accurate information must continuously be brought forward so that distortions are not learned and passed on to future generations.

Culture Area: All culture areas of North America, including the Circum-Caribbean culture area

Time Period: Pre-1492 contact period to the present

Background: There are numerous inaccuracies, distortions, and omissions in textbooks and other published materials about the man, Cristobal Colón (whose Spanish name was later anglicized to Christopher Columbus), his actual deeds, and the consequences of his arrival in the Western Hemisphere. For example, we are told that Columbus “discovered America,” yet he landed — by sheer chance and error — in already inhabited islands in the Caribbean, which some say are current day Bahamas, Haiti, and the Dominican Republic. We are told that he went to sea in search of adventure or to prove the world is round although the latter fact was well established among the educated people of his day. Historical research further indicates that he went in search of gold and other riches and to ensure that his name would be known among the many maritime explorers of his day. He is reported to have been an heroic navigator, but he greatly miscalculated the distance to the Orient; his erroneous calculations of the size of the earth were rejected by the scholars of the day; he intentionally falsified his mileage logs; and he forced his sailors to swear an oath that Cuba was the Asian continent.

Students and the general public have the right to accurate depictions of historical figures, particularly if an individual’s deeds are being cited as a cause for celebration. The following lessons offer opportunities for students to seek alternative perspectives on the life and actions of Columbus and comprehend their contemporary relevance.

Objectives:

Knowledge (Content) — Students will:

1. learn accurate but little known facts about the life of Columbus and the consequences of his actions,
2. recognize at least two divergent points of view on whether the Quincentennial should or should not be celebrated,
3. cite several scientific, mathematical, and other contributions made to the world by Native people of the America, and

4. recognize and discuss the influence historical events have on contemporary issues and problems.

Skills — Students will:

1. use research skills,
2. synthesize information,
3. learn and use debating skills, and
4. use reasoned judgment to take stands on issues.

Values (Organic) — Students will:

1. recognize that there are multiple perspectives on any issue or event,
2. derive their own personal perspective on the myths and truths surrounding Christopher Columbus, and
3. recognize the influence of value systems on behavior.

Activities:

1. The teacher should obtain the video *The Columbus Controversy: Challenging How History Is Written*. (A free preview copy can be obtained by telephoning American School Publishers in Chicago at 800-483-8855.)
2. Divide the class into two groups — those who agree the arrival of Columbus in the Western Hemisphere should be celebrated and those who disagree.
3. Show the 24-minute video, which provides both perspectives. Remind students to be alert to, and take notes on, points made in the video that will support their group's position.
4. Allow 10 to 15 minutes (or longer, depending on available class time) for the groups to meet and quickly consolidate their persuasive arguments, based on the video and previous knowledge. Appoint two debaters from each group.
5. Make prior arrangements for the students to conduct a debate before another class, which will vote on which group's arguments were most compelling.
6. A student will introduce the debate topic. Each group has 5 minutes (or longer, depending on available class time) to present its most cogent and persuasive points. The groups may divide the 5 minutes between their two presenters and use all 5 minutes at once or have the first presenter of one group speak for 2 and 1/2 minutes, followed by the first presenter of the other group, alternating until the allotted time is used. The vote follows.

Evaluation:

Students will be evaluated on their positive contribution to gathering information, determining key points to be made, and using debating skills.

Resources:

The Columbus controversy: Challenging how history is written. (1991). (Video). Chicago, IL: American School Publishers. (800-843-8855).

Additional Appropriate Activities and Extensions:

1. Role play a city/town council meeting at which the most important agenda item is whether you should change Columbus Day to Indigenous People's Day, following the lead of the City Council of Berkeley, California, in January 1992. Besides playing the role of council members (some of whom are conservatives, liberals, and fence-sitters), include in your audience the following interested parties: an Indian elder, a young Indian activist, a textbook publisher, an official from the local Italian-American organizations, and a geography professor. Research and develop your point of view. Consider such alternative courses of action as creating a separate Italian-American Heritage Day, a National Multicultural Day, or the proposed Indigenous People's Day but on a date considered more relevant to Native groups than October 12. Conduct the role play in front of at least one other class. Hold a referendum among the two classes. Each student votes and writes one paragraph of rationale for his or her position on the ballot.
2. Research the transatlantic slave trade, whereby the indigenous people of the islands were captured, shipped to Europe, and sold as slaves, a practice initiated by Columbus when he could not find enough gold on his second and subsequent voyages, and carried out without the consent of his sponsors, the King and Queen of Spain. Document how this slave trade was later expanded into Africa, where enslaved populations were brought over to work the Caribbean sugar plantations. Write a paper that summarizes your research. Conclude your paper by exploring the question, "Did these early exploitations in slavery sow the seeds of today's interracial problems?" The following are suggested resources:

Fletcher, B. (1991). African Americans: Mourn the Quincentenary and celebrate resistance. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th Anniversary of Columbus's Arrival in America*. [Special issue]. *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI.

Koning, H. (1992). *Columbus: His enterprise: Exploding the myth*. New York, NY: Monthly Review.
3. Working in small groups, research quotes by Columbus in his journal or letters or by Bartolomé de las Casas, the Dominican friar who was a contemporary of Columbus and chronicled the journeys. Select one quote and analyze it for the values it depicts. Write a one to two page analysis. Share class analyses with a journalism class. A sample quote is from an October 14, 1492, letter to the Spanish Crown: "These people are very unskilled in arms.....when your Highnesses so command, they can be carried off to Castile or held captive in the island

itself, since with 50 men they would be all kept in subjection and forced to do whatever may be wished." Quotations may be found in the following:

Casas, B. de las. (1971). *History of the Indies*. (A.M. Collard, Trans.) New York, NY: Harper & Row Torchbooks.

Jane, C. (Ed.). (1987). *The journal of Christopher Columbus*. New York, NY: Outlet/Crown Publishing.

Sale, K. (1990). *The conquest of paradise: Christopher Columbus and the Columbian legacy*. New York, NY: Knopf.

4. The Bering Strait theory continues to be talked about and taught to whole generations as unquestioned fact when it is only one of several theories about the origin of humans in the Americas. There are recent anthropological and archeological finds which indicate a much earlier date for Native habitation of North America and which may even indicate that the cross-migration between North America and Asia started here and went East. Based on your research, work in pairs and write up to four sample paragraphs for your history textbook, citing the newest available evidence. Mail all suggestions to textbook publishers. The following is an excellent resource:

Goodman, J. (1982). *American genesis: The American Indian and the origins of modern man*. New York, NY: Summit.

5. Obtain and view the video *The Sun Dagger*. Discuss what it teaches us about the ancient astronomers who built this sun observatory thousands of years ago. Conduct research and then expand your discussion to cite other examples of the mathematical and scientific knowledge of the North, Central, and South American Indians, knowledge possessed long before the arrival of the first Europeans. Also discuss why we rarely learn about the advancements made by ancient Indian civilizations. Relate the discussion to the Quincentennial by having a dialogue on why more and more people say two old worlds encountered each other; it was not a case of one "old" world meeting a "new" world.

The Sun Dagger. (1983). (Video). Portland, OR: Portland State University. (505-725-4846).

6. In South America the Native people refer to the arrival of Columbus in the Western Hemisphere as "The Continental Misfortune." Write an essay citing specific reasons why they would term it so. Many feel the exploitation of the Native people and the land, initiated by Columbus, has continued to the present day, as evidenced by the struggles for self-determination in Guatemala and the destruction of the Amazon rain forest. For background information, the following resources are suggested:

Alegría, C., et al. (1992). *Ariel's Song: Latino and Latin American voices in the Quincentenary*. Willimantic, CT: Curbstone Press. (321 Jackson St., Willimantic, CT 06226)

Cultural Survival Quarterly. (1989). (A special issue devoted to indigenous peoples of Central America and the Caribbean)

Columbus didn't discover us. (1990). (Video). Wendell, MA: Turning Tide Productions. (508-544-8313)

7. Conduct a role play in which each student in the class is a member of a highly acclaimed American Indian youth choir that has been asked to perform traditional songs and dances during various events celebrating Columbus' arrival in the Western Hemisphere. While the choir can gain experience and earn money, there are strong philosophical questions to be answered. Some ask: "Should we be part of a celebration of an event that resulted in genocide for millions of Native people through torture, maulings by dogs, disease, famine, and killings?" Others worry that some of their own people and family members may be upset with them if they decide to perform. Yet, others see an important opportunity to contribute to a better understanding of Native culture by performing before the large audience. What should the choir do? Have students debate the issue and make personal decisions on whether or not each student would participate if they were a member of the choir. Discuss how historical events continue to have repercussions for 20th Century citizens. Share your experience with a nearby Indian Center and/or an Indian newspaper.
8. Many groups have written resolutions regarding the Columbus Quincentennial, such as the National Indian Education Association, National Council for the Social Studies, American Librarians Association, National Council of Churches, and the Indigenous Alliance of the Americas. Share the two resolutions included in this packet with students. Find others. Note similarities and differences in the language used. As a class, decide what your position is on the Quincentennial and draft your own resolution, citing positive and/or negative consequences of the meeting of the two "old" worlds. Share with your school newspaper and Student Council. Encourage the Student Council to draft a school-wide resolution.
9. President Bush declared 1992 as the "Year of the American Indian." Share the copy of that declaration included in this packet with students. 1993 has been declared the "Year of the Indigenous People" by the United Nations. Some contemporary writers say we need to focus on the next 500 years as a time of healing. Brainstorm as many ideas as possible how your class and/or school should acknowledge these two pronouncements. Share your ideas with the rest of the student body. Decide on and carry out at least three of the proposed activities/projects as a class and a school. An excellent article about soliciting ideas for rewriting history with secondary students follows:

Bigelow, B. (1991). Talking back to Columbus: Teaching for justice and hope. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus's arrival in America*. [special issue]. *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI.

10. Columbus was not the first explorer to exploit the natural resources of the regions he entered, but his influence was significant. The noted author Kirkpatrick Sale writes about the past 500 years as “. . . the destruction of primal environments, the eradication and abuse of the species, and the impending catastrophe of ecocide for the planet Earth.” Research examples of ecocide (the destruction of the ecology of a region) resulting from the arrival of Columbus and later Europeans in North America. Summarize your findings. As a class, determine a local example of ecocide; decide and act on solutions to the problem. You will be following the motto of many environmental groups: Think globally; act locally.

Sale, K. (1990). *The conquest of paradise: Christopher Columbus and the Columbian legacy*. New York, NY: Knopf.

11. Hold a class discussion regarding reasons why the myth of Columbus as hero has been perpetuated. Heroes aren't usually returned to their homelands in chains. To ignore many negative acts and consequences is a serious perversion of history. Who would benefit by maintaining this myth? Why do people not care about geographical and historical inaccuracies? Why isn't appropriate credit given to earlier explorers? Who would not want a reappraisal of colonialism? The publishing companies can influence whether historical accuracy or romantic myths are taught in schools through the content of text books. Draft letters of concern to textbook publishers. Brainstorm other ways to encourage an honest, accurate, and complete depiction of history. Act on at least one idea. Two related resources are cited below. The first is a compilation of writings, several by Indian authors; the second is a scholarly effort to rethink the history of this country.

Joseph, A. (Ed.). (1992). *America in 1492*. New York, NY: Knopf.

Zinn, H. (1981). *A people's history of the United States*. New York, NY: Harper & Row.

Teaching about Columbus in High School

A Unit: Creating a Play about the Encounter between Columbus and Native Peoples of the Americas

Grade Level: High School (Grades 10-12)

Basic Concept: Historical bias

Organizing Generalizations: The culture, beliefs, and value systems of people influence their perceptions of behaviors and historical and contemporary events. As a consequence, the recordings of these behaviors and events are not accurate, but reflect the culture, ethics, and moral judgments of the recorders. Historical biases favoring the European perspective resulted from selective recording of significant events during the encounter between Columbus and Native peoples of the Western Hemisphere.

Culture Area: All culture areas of North America including the Circum-Caribbean culture area

Time Period: Pre-1492 contact period to the present

Background: The historical events of the encounter of Columbus and the Native peoples of the Western Hemisphere have been presented primarily from the European perspective. In most accounts, the exploits of the Europeans are described as deeds representing valor, honor and merit, while the behaviors and reactions of the Native people are described as savage, ignorant, and childlike. A review and analysis of the events and behaviors from different perspectives provide an understanding of the beliefs, values, and attitudes of all the groups involved. The introduction of bias in recording events continues in the present day with contemporary events through selective reporting of significant events.

Objectives:

Knowledge (Content) — Students will:

1. investigate sources of historical accounts of the encounter,
2. identify a sequence of significant historical events from different perspectives,
3. identify bias through comparison of historical events reported from different perspectives, and
4. describe source of bias (values, beliefs, etc.) in historical and contemporary accounts of significant events.

Skills — Students will:

1. use library research skills,
2. use creative thinking abilities,

3. use judgement skills in selecting significant events and sequences from recorded history,
4. use synthesis skills interpreting historical events in reporting events in their own words,
5. develop analytic skills in comparing and contrasting perspectives of historical events, and
6. develop creative skills in presenting a multiple perspective version of history.

Values (Organic) — Students will:

1. appreciate the role of values in recorded history,
2. recognize the role of perspective in history, and
3. analyze the ethics involved in biased reporting of historical events.

Activities:

1. The teacher should gather several copies of various materials that relate the encounter from a variety of perspectives. The materials should include excerpts from Columbus' logs for students to use in developing a script of significant events during the encounter between Columbus and the Native peoples of the Americas.
2. Divide the class into a "European" reference group and a "Native" reference group. The groups will work independently and separately from one another until the products of their efforts are merged as described below.
3. Within each group, discuss how to develop an understanding of group identity, awareness, and sensitivity to events and issues that might be important to the group.
4. Each group will read and study *The Diario of Christopher Columbus's First Voyage to American 1492-1493: Abstracted by Fray Bartolomé de las Casas* transcribed and translated into English by Oliver Dunn and James E. Kelley, Jr., (1989); *The Journal of Christopher Columbus*, by Jane (1987); *The Conquest of New Spain* by Diaz del Castillo (1963) which presents the story of the conquest from a strictly Spanish perspective; and *The Conquest of Paradise: Christopher Columbus and the Columbian Legacy* by Kirkpatrick Sale, a highly recommended source. Other supplementary references and resource materials of the encounter should include all four voyages of Columbus and the intervening events. Each group should:
 - a. identify and select events in the references that are significant from the perspective of the reference group,
 - b. explain why the event is significant for that group,
 - c. note events and behaviors of merit, valor and ethics, and

- d. identify beliefs, values, and attitudes associated with the events and behaviors.

The following references are useful, as well as other references provided below under resources.

Cohen, J. (Ed. & Trans.). (1969). *The four voyages of Columbus*. Baltimore, MD: Penguin.

Diaz del Castillo, B. (1963). *The conquest of New Spain*. (J. Cohen, Trans.). New York, NY: Penguin Books. (Caution: Strictly a Spanish perspective).

Dunn, O., & Kelley, J.E. (1989). *The Diario of Christopher Columbus's First Voyage to America 1492-1493: Abstracted by Fray Bartolomé de las Casas*. (Transcribed and translated into English, with notes and a concordance of the Spanish). Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press.

Jane, C. (Ed.). (1987). *The journal of Christopher Columbus*. New York, NY: Outlet/Crown. (Beginning reading level)

Sale, K. (1990). *The conquest of paradise: Christopher Columbus and the Columbian legacy*. New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf.

5. Each group will develop a script of key events based exclusively on historical accounts and reference materials.
6. Each group will develop a re-enactment of the events using their script.
7. Each group will develop a narration that interprets for the audience the beliefs, values, and attitudes of the reference group associated with key events in the re-enactment.
8. The groups will merge their scripts and narration based upon the chronology of the events. In many cases, the same event will be portrayed from different perspectives. The actions in the scripts should remain absolutely true to historical records of events. However, the interpretation of the events based on the different value systems may vary dramatically. The content, meaning and interpretation of the events as perceived by the two reference groups and presented in the narratives should not change during the merging of the scripts.
9. Perform the merged re-enactment. Repeat and rehearse until the performance of the re-enactment by each group is satisfactory within the group and the whole play flows satisfactorily.
10. Present the re-enactment to the school community and video tape the re-enactment.
11. As a whole class, view the video. Then, discuss and analyze the portrayed events and behaviors of the two groups. Compare, contrast and discuss the beliefs, values, and attitudes explained in the narrations.

Evaluation:

Students, teachers and audience will evaluate the learning project. Students will evaluate the extent of their personal learning about the role of beliefs, values, and attitudes in the presentation of historical events during the encounter of Columbus and Native peoples of the Western Hemisphere. The audience will evaluate the performance of the re-enactment in terms of new awareness of historical events and the beliefs, values and attitudes represented in behaviors.

Resources:

- Casas, B. de las. (1989). *The log of Christopher Columbus' first voyage to America: In the year 1492, as copied out in brief by Bartolomé de las Casas*. Hamden, CT: Linnet Books.
- Casas, B. de las. (1971). *History of the Indies*. (A.M. Collard, Trans.). New York, NY: Harper & Row.
- Casas, B. de las. (1656/1972). *The tears of the Indians*. New York, NY: Oriole Chapbooks.
- Casas, B. de las. (1974). *The devastation of the Indies*. (H. Briffault, Trans.). New York, NY: Seabury.
- Cohen, J. (Ed. & Trans.). (1969). *The four voyages of Columbus*. Baltimore, MD: Penguin.
- Diaz del Castillo, B. (1963). *The conquest of New Spain*. (J. Cohen, Trans.). New York, NY: Penguin Books. (Caution: Strictly a Spanish perspective).
- Dunn, O., & Kelley, J.E. (1989). *The Diario of Christopher Columbus's First Voyage to American 1492-1493: Abstracted by Fray Bartolomé de las Casas* (Transcribed and translated into English, with notes and a concordance of the Spanish). Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press.
- Fuson, R. (1987). *The log of Christopher Columbus*. Camden, ME: International Marine.
- Giardini, C. (1987). *The life and times of Columbus*. (F. Lanza, Trans.). London, England: Paul Hamlyn.
- Jane, C. (Ed.). (1987). *The journal of Christopher Columbus*. New York, NY: Outlet Book Company/Crown Publishing Co.
- Keen, B. (1959). *The life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by his son Ferdinand*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press. (Caution: Strictly a Spanish perspective of the life of Columbus).
- Koning H. (1991). *Columbus: His enterprise: Exploding the myth*. New York, NY: Monthly Review Press.
- Leon-Portilla, M. (1990). *The broken spears: The Aztec account of the conquest of Mexico*. (Expanded and updated edition; originally published in 1962) Boston, MA: Beacon. (Note: This volume provides an Aztec perspective of the conquest of Tenochtitlan by the Spanish and rival tribes under Cortez)

Sale, K. (1990). *The conquest of paradise: Christopher Columbus and the Columbian legacy*. New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf.

Additional Appropriate Activities and Extensions:

1. Compare and contrast European and Native perspectives of other historic events based on literature, such as the Colorado gold rush, Trail of Tears, and slaughter of buffalo on the plains.
2. Identify and explain systems of beliefs, values, and attitudes associated with historic behaviors of the groups involved in other historic events.
3. Identify and explain systems of beliefs, values, and attitudes of historians reporting events of the encounter and other historic events.
4. Investigate the meaning of virtue, ethics, and morality as perceived by the different groups involved in other historic events.
5. Have students identify and examine their personal beliefs, values, and attitudes based upon their evaluation and interpretation of their experience working with people of other cultures.
6. Have students adopt and justify a personal position on the role of values and ethics in intercultural relations from personal experiences.
7. Use case studies of contemporary events involving conflicting sets of values. Determine how the contemporary record of these events does or does not contain bias from the perspective of those reporting on the event.

Bibliography

- Alegría, C., et al. (1992). *Ariel's Song: Latino and Latin American voices in the Quincentenary*. Willimantic, CT: Curbstone Press. (321 Jackson St., Willimantic, CT 06226)
- American School Publishers. (1991). *The Columbus controversy: Challenging how history is written*. [Video].
- Anderson, A., & Dibble, C. (Trans.). (1978). *The war of conquest: The Aztecs' own story as given to Friar Bernardino Sahagun*. Salt Lake City, UT: University of Utah.
- Arens, W. (1979). *The man-eating myth*. New York, NY: Oxford University.
- Barreiro, J. (Ed.). (1990, Fall). View from the shore: American Indian perspectives on the Quincentenary. [Special issue]. *Northeast Indian Quarterly*, VII(3).
- Bedini, S.A. (Ed.). (1991). *The Christopher Columbus encyclopedia*. New York, NY: Simon & Schuster.
- Bigelow, B. (1989, October). Discovering Columbus: Rereading the past. *Language Arts*, 66(6). pp. 635-643.
- Bigelow, B. (1990). Once upon a genocide: A review of Christopher Columbus in children's literature. In *Rethinking Schools*, 5(1), October/November. Milwaukee, WI.
- Bigelow, B. (1991). Talking back to Columbus: Teaching for justice and hope. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus' arrival in America*. [Special issue]. *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI.
- Bigelow, B. (1991). Timeline: Spain, Columbus and Native Americans. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus' arrival in America*. [Special issue]. *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI.
- Boorstein, D. (1985). *The discoverers*. New York, NY: Vintage.
- Bruchac, J. (1991). Thanking the birds. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus' arrival in America*. [Special issue]. *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI. p. 11. (Excerpted from the afterword in Caduto, M.J., & Bruchac, J. (1988). *Keepers of the earth, Native American stories and environmental activities for children*. Golden, CO: Fulcrum, Inc.
- Butterfield, R.A. (1983). The development and use of culturally appropriate curriculum for American Indian students. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 61(1), pp. 49-66.
- Carew, J. (1988). *Fulcrums of change*. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press.
- Casas, B. de las. (1971). *History of the Indies*. (A. Collard, Trans.). New York, NY: Harper & Row.
- Casas, B. de las. (1656/1972). *The tears of the Indians*. New York, NY: Oriole Chapbooks.
- Casas, B. de las. (1974). *The devastation of the Indies*. (H. Briffault, Trans.). New York, NY: Seabury.

- Casas, B. de las. (1989). *The log of Christopher Columbus' first voyage to America: In the year 1492, as copied out in brief by Bartolomé de las Casas*. Hamden, CT: Linnet Books.
- Charging Eagle, T., & Zeilinger, R. (1987). *Black Hills: Scared hills*. Chamberlain, SD: Tipi Press.
- Charleston, G.M., & Lanser, M. (1992). *Briefing book III: National evaluation symposium*. Rockville, MD: U.S. Indian Health Service, Office of Planning, Evaluation and Legislation. (5600 Fishers Lane, Room 6-40, Parklawn Building, Rockville, MD 20857. (301-443-4700) [For 1990 Census].
- Cherry, L. (1992). *A river ran wild: An environmental history*. New York, NY: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- Christensen, L. (1991). Unlearning myths that bind us: Students critiquing stereotypes in children's stories and films. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus' arrival in America*. [Special Issue]. *Rethinking Schools* Milwaukee, WI.
- Cohen, J. (Ed. & Trans.). (1969). *The four voyages of Columbus*. Baltimore, MD: Penguin.
- Columbus didn't discover us*. (1990). (Video). Wendell, MA: Turning Tide Productions. (508-544-8313)
- Crosby, A. (1972). *The Columbian exchange: Biological and cultural consequences of 1492*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.
- Crosby, A. (1986). *Ecological imperialism: The biological expansion of Europe*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University.
- Crosby, A. (1987). *The Columbian voyages, the Columbian exchange, and their historians*. Washington, DC: American Historical Association.
- Cultural Survival Quarterly*. (1989). (A special issue devoted to indigenous peoples of Central America and the Caribbean)
- Curl, J. (1988). *Columbus in the Bay of Pigs*. Berkeley, CA: Homeward.
- Deak, G. (1991, October). Everything you need to know about Columbus. *American Heritage*. pp. 40-54.
- Derman-Sparks, L., et al. (1989). *Anti-bias curriculum, tools for empowering young children*. Washington, DC: National Association for the Education of Young Children.
- Diaz del Castillo, B. (1963). *The conquest of New Spain*. (J. Cohen, Trans.). New York, NY: Penguin Books. (Caution: Strictly a Spanish perspective).
- Dunn, O., & Kelley, J.E. (1989). *The Diario of Christopher Columbus's First Voyage to American 1492-1493: Abstracted by Fray Bartolomé de las Casas*. (Transcribed and translated into English, with notes and a concordance of the Spanish). Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press.

- Durham, J. (1983). *Columbus Day*. Albuquerque, NM: West End Press.
- Elliott, J.H. (1970). *The old world and the new, 1492-1650*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.
- First Continental Congress of Indigenous Peoples. (1990). *Columbus didn't discover us* [Video]. Wendell, MA: Turning Tide Productions.
- Fletcher, B. (1991). African Americans: Mourn the Quincentenary and celebrate resistance. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th Anniversary of Columbus's Arrival in America*. [Special issue]. *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI.
- Fuson, R. (1987). *The log of Christopher Columbus*. Camden, ME: International Marine.
- Galeano, E. (1973). *Open veins of Latin America: Five centuries of the pillage of a continent*. New York, NY: Monthly Review.
- Giardini, C. (1987). *The life and times of Columbus*. (F. Lanza, Trans.). London, England: Paul Hamlyn.
- Golden, R., McConnell, M., & Poppen, C. (1992). *Dangerous memories: Invasion and resistance since 1492*. Chicago, IL: Chicago Religious Task Force on Central America.
- Goodman, J. (1982). *American genesis: The American Indian and the origins of modern man*. New York, NY: Summit.
- Hirschfelder, A. (1982). *American Indian stereotypes in the world of children: A reader and a bibliography*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow.
- Hodgkinson, H., et al. (1990). *The demographics of American Indians: One percent of the people; fifty percent of the diversity*. Washington, D.C.: Institute for Educational Leadership. (Available also through the American Indian Science and Engineering Society, Boulder, CO. 303-492-8658)
- Horne, G. (1988). *Thinking and rethinking U.S. history*. New York, NY: Council on Interracial Books for Children.
- Hoxie, F. (Ed.). (1988). *Indians in American history: An introduction*. Arlington Heights, IL: Harlan Davidson.
- Jaimés, M. (Ed.). (1991). *The state of native America: genocide, colonization & resistance*. Boston, MA: South End.
- Jane, C. (Ed.). (1987). *The journal of Christopher Columbus*. New York, NY: Outlet/Crown.
- Jeffers, S. (1992). *Brother eagle, sister sky: A message from Chief Seattle*. New York, NY: Dial.
- Jennings, F. (1965). *The invasion of America: Indians, colonialism, and the cant of conquest*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina.
- Jennings, F. (1975). *The invasion of America*. New York, NY: Norton.

- Johnson, S. (1971). *The value of curiosity: The story of Christopher Columbus*. La Jolla, CA: Value Communications.
- Josephy, A. (Ed.). (1991). *America in 1492*. New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf.
- Kalosh, A. (1991). Sailing with a Viking. *World Monitor*, September, 22 (6).
- Keen, B. (1959). *The life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus by his son Ferdinand*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press. (Caution: Strictly a Spanish perspective of the life of Columbus).
- Koning, H. (1976). *Columbus: His enterprise*. New York, NY: Monthly Review.
- Koning, H. (1991). *Columbus: His enterprise: Exploding the myth*. New York, NY: Monthly Review.
- Leon-Portilla, M. (1969). *Pre-Columbian literatures of Mexico*. (G. Lobanov and M. Leon-Portilla, Trans.). Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press.
- Leon-Portilla, M. (1990). *The broken spears: The Aztec account of the conquest of Mexico*. (Expanded and updated edition; originally published in 1962) Boston, MA: Beacon.
- Levinson, N. (1990). *Christopher Columbus: Voyager to the unknown*. New York, NY: Dutton/Lodestar Books.
- Liestman, V. (1991). *Columbus day*. Minneapolis, MN: Carolrhoda Books.
- Lunenfeld, M. (1991). *1492: Discovery, invasion, encounter*. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath.
- MacGill-Callahan, S. (1991). *And still the turtle watched*. New York, NY: Dial.
- MacLeish, W. (1991, November). 1492 America: The land Columbus never saw. *Smithsonian*, 22(8), pp. 34-52.
- Mander, J. (1991). *In the absence of the sacred: The failure of technology and the rise of Indian nations*. Sierra Club Books.
- Meltzer, M. (1990). *Columbus and the world around him*. New York, NY: Franklin Watts.
- Morison, S. (1978). *The great explorers: The European discovery of America*. New York, NY: Oxford University.
- Napier, L. (1992). Hollywood's new treatment of Native American Indians: Fit for inclusion in the curriculum? *The Review of Education*, vol. 14
- Network of Educators on Central America. (1992). Columbus textbook evaluation: Questions to think about. In *Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus's arrival in America* [Special issue]. (1991) *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI.
- Networking newsletter to link counter-Columbus quincentenary activities [Special issue]. (1991, March/June). *Indigenous Thought*.
- Ortiz, S. (1987). *The people shall continue*. (Revised). San Francisco, CA: Children's Book Press.

- Pahl, R. H. (1992, January/February). How should we teach about Columbus — as a hero or a villain? A commentary on Hans Koning's *Columbus: His enterprise: Exploding the myth*. *Social Studies*, p. 27.
- Palmer, C. (1992, September). African slave trade: The cruelest commerce. *National Geographic*, 182(3), pp. 62-91.
- Quincentennial Education Project, Central America Resource Center. (1991-1992). *1492 1992: Exploring the past to discover the present*. [Curriculum packets K-6, 7-12]. Minneapolis, MN: Central America Resource Center.
- Racism and Sexism Resource Center for Educators. (1981). *Unlearning "Indian" stereotypes, a teaching unit for elementary teachers and children's librarians*. New York, NY: Council on Interracial Books for Children.
- Rediscover the history of the Americas [Special issue]. (1991, August). *Clergy and Laity Concerned Report*.
- Rethinking Columbus: Teaching about the 500th anniversary of Columbus's arrival in America* [Special issue]. (1991) *Rethinking Schools*. Milwaukee, WI. (Order from Rethinking Schools, 1001 E. Keefe Ave., Milwaukee, WI 53212)
- Sale, K. (1990). *The conquest of paradise: Christopher Columbus and the Columbian legacy*. New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf.
- Seeds of change: Readings in cultural exchange after 1492*. Menlo Park, CA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co. (128 page text with teacher's guide for high school grades, available from Addison-Wesley, 2725 Sand Hill Rd., Menlo Park, CA 94025, (800-447-2226).
- Seeds of change: The story of cultural exchange after 1492*. Menlo Park, CA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co. (96 page text with teacher's guide for grades 5-8, available from Addison-Wesley, 2725 Sand Hill Rd., Menlo Park, CA 94025, (800-447-2226).
- Slapin, B., et al. (1991). How to tell the difference: A checklist. In Slapin, B., & Seale, D. (Eds.) *Through Indian eyes: The Native experience in books for children*. Philadelphia, PA: New Society.
- Slapin, B., & Seale, D. (Eds.). (1991). *Through Indian eyes: The Native experience in books for children*. Philadelphia, PA: New Society.
- Small, D., & Jaffe, M. (1991). *1492: What is it like to be discovered?* New York, NY: Monthly Review Press.
- The Columbus controversy: Challenging how history is written*. (1991). (Video). Chicago, IL: American School Publishers. (A free preview copy can be obtained by telephoning American School Publishers in Chicago at 800-483-8855).
- The Sun Dagger*. (1983). (Video). Portland, OR: Portland State University. (505-725-4846).
- Thornton, R. (1987). *American Indian holocaust and survival: A population history since 1492*. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press.

- Van Sertima, I. (1989). *They came before Columbus: The African presence in ancient America*. New York, NY: David McCay Company.
- Viola, H.J., & Margolis, C. (Eds.). (1991). *Seeds of change: A quincentennial commemoration*. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution.
- Waldman, C. (1985). *Atlas of the North American Indian*. New York, NY: Facts on File.
- Weatherford, J. (1989). *Indian givers: How the Indians of the Americas transformed the world*. New York, NY: Fawcet Book Group.
- Weatherford, J. (1991). *Native roots: How the Indians enriched America*. New York, NY: Crown.
- Wooster, J. S. (1992, April/May). Choosing materials for teaching about the Columbian Quincentenary. *Social Education*, 56(4), pp. 244-249.
- Yewell, J., Dodge, C., & DeSirey, J. (Eds.). (1992). *Confronting Columbus: An anthology*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company.
- Yolen, J. (1992). *Encounter*. New York, NY: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- Zinn, H. (1981). *A people's history of the United States*. New York, NY: Harper & Row.
- Zinn, H. (1981). Columbus, the Indians, and human progress. In H. Zinn, *A people's history of the United States*. (pp. 1-22). New York, NY: Harper & Row.